

Thomas C. Horne
 Attorney General
 Firm Bar No: 14000
 Joy Hernbrode (020494)
 Laurie A. Hachtel (015949)
 Edwin Slade (029807)
 Assistant Attorneys General
 Natural Resources Section
 1275 West Washington Street
 Phoenix, Arizona 85007-2997
 Phone No.: (602) 542-8342
 Fax No.: (602) 542-4084
 Email: NaturalResources@azag.gov
 Attorneys for the Arizona State Land Department

**BEFORE THE
 ARIZONA NAVIGABLE STREAM ADJUDICATION COMMISSION**

IN THE MATTER OF THE NAVIGABILITY
 OF THE GILA RIVER FROM THE NEW
 MEXICO BORDER TO THE CONFLUENCE
 WITH THE COLORADO RIVER,
 GREENLEE, GRAHAM, GILA, PINAL,
 MARICOPA AND YUMA COUNTIES,
 ARIZONA.

No. 03-007-NAV

**ARIZONA STATE LAND
 DEPARTMENT’S NOTICE OF EIGHTH
 SUPPLEMENTAL SUBMISSION OF
 EVIDENCE REGARDING THE GILA
 RIVER**

The Arizona State Land Department (“ASLD” or the “Department”) hereby submits the following eighth supplemental evidence in the above-referenced matter. ASLD reserves the right to supplement its evidence through the close of evidence.

TAB NO.	DESCRIPTION
127	Additional Requested Citations for Jon Fuller PowerPoint Presentation (X020-79)
128	Amended Slides from Jon Fuller’s June, 11, 2014 PowerPoint Presentation (X020-79)

DATED: August 20, 2014.

THOMAS C. HORNE
Attorney General

/s/ Joy L. Hernbrode
Joy L. Hernbrode
Edwin Slade
Laurie A. Hachtel
Assistant Attorneys General
Attorneys for the Arizona State Land Department

ORIGINAL AND SIX COPIES of the foregoing
hand-delivered for filing this 20th day of
August, 2014, to:

Arizona Navigable Stream Adjudication Commission
1700 W. Washington
Room B-54
Phoenix, AZ 85007

COPY of the foregoing mailed this 20th day of
August, 2014, to:

Fred E. Breedlove III
Squire Sanders
1 E. Washington St., Suite 2700
Phoenix, Arizona 85004
Attorney for Arizona Navigable Stream Adjudication Commission

John B. Weldon, Jr.
Mark A. McGinnis
Salmon, Lewis and Weldon, PLC
2850 East Camelback Rd., Ste. 200
Phoenix, AZ 85016-4316
Attorneys for the Salt River Project Agricultural Improvement and
Power District and Salt River Valley Water Users' Association

Cynthia M. Chandley
Robert J. Pohlman
L. William Staudenmaier
Christopher W. Payne
Snell & Wilmer
400 East Van Buren
Phoenix, AZ 85004-2022
Attorneys for Freeport-McMoRan Copper & Gold Inc.

Sean Hood, Esq.
Fennemore Craig, P.C.
2394 East Camelback, Suite 600
Phoenix, AZ 85016-3429
Attorneys for Freeport-McMoRan Copper & Gold, Inc.

Joy Herr-Cardillo
AZ Center for Law in the Public Interest
2205 East Speedway Blvd.
Tucson, AZ 85719-0001
Attorneys for Defenders of Wildlife, Donald Steuter, Jerry Van Gasse
and Jim Vaaler

Joe Sparks
John H. Ryley
The Sparks Law Firm, P.C.
7503 First Street
Scottsdale, AZ 85251-4201
Attorneys for San Carlos Apache Tribe

John Helm
Sally Worthington
Helm, Livesay & Worthington, Ltd.
1619 East Guadalupe, Suite One
Tempe, AZ 85283-3970
Attorneys for Maricopa County

Steven L. Wene
Moyes Sellers & Sims
1850 N Central Ave, #1100
Phoenix, AZ 85004
Attorneys for Board of Regents/Arizona State University

Cynthia S. Campbell
City of Phoenix
200 West Washington, #1300
Phoenix, AZ 85003-1611
Attorney for City of Phoenix

William H. Anger
Engelman Berger, P.C.
Security Title Plaza, Suite 700
3636 North Central Avenue
Phoenix, Arizona 85012
Attorney for City of Mesa

Charles L. Cahoy
Assistant City Attorney
City of Tempe
21 East Sixth Street, Suite 201
Tempe, AZ 85281
Attorney for City of Tempe

Michael J. Pearce
Maguire & Pearce PLLC
2999 N 44th St. Suite 630
Phoenix, AZ 85018-0001
Attorney for Home Builders Association of Central Arizona

Carla A. Consoli
Lewis & Roca, LLP
40 North Central Avenue
Phoenix, AZ 85004-4429
Attorney for CEMEX CEMENT, INC.

James T. Braselton
Mariscal, Weeks, McIntyre & Friedlander
2901 North Central Avenue, #200
Phoenix, AZ 85012-2705
Attorney for Land Title Association of Arizona

Julie M. Lemmon
1095 W Rio Salado Parkway, Suite 102
Tempe, AZ 85281
Attorney for Flood District of Maricopa County

Linus Everling
Thomas L. Murphy
Gila River Indian Community
P.O. Box 97
Sacaton, AZ 85247
Attorneys for Gila River Indian Community

Sandy Bahr
202 East McDowell Road, Ste. 277
Phoenix, AZ 85004
For the Sierra Club

David A. Brown
Brown & Brown Law Offices
128 East Commercial
P.O. Box 1890
St. Johns, AZ 85936

Susan B. Montgomery
Robyn Interpreter
Montgomery & Interpreter P.L.C.
4835 East Cactus Road, Suite 210
Scottsdale, AZ 85254
Attorneys for Yavapai-Apache Nation

/s/ Paula Brewer
Paula Brewer
4114076

127

Historical Photographs



Gila River near
Wellton
Crossing, 1910

From:
Littlefield, 2014

Gila River Rating Curves

- Comparison to Other Experts' Estimates (Burtell)
 - Segment 1: < 1.7-1.8 ft (hydraulic depth) - Virden
 - Segment 1: < 1.6 ft (hydraulic depth) - York
 - Segment 2: < 2.0 (hydraulic depth) - Clifton
 - Segment 2: 1.1-2.5 ft (hydraulic depth) – Bonita Ck
 - Segment 3: < 2.0 ft (hydraulic depth) - Solomonville
 - Segment 3: < 2.0 (hydraulic depth) - Ashurst
 - Segment 3: < 1.8 ft (hydraulic depth) - Calva
 - Segment 4: < 1.8 ft (hydraulic depth) – Coolidge Dam

Gila River Rating Curves

- Comparison to Other Experts' Estimates (Gookin)
 - Based on Modeling Cross Section from Historical Topo
 - Potential Issues with Cross Section/Model

■ Results	Kelvin	Above Salt River
■ Mean	0.70 ft (1.7 ft)	0.98 ft
■ Median	0.55 ft (1.4 ft)	0.74 ft
■ Low Flow	0.44 ft (1.1 ft)	0.24 ft

128

Additional Requested Citations for Fuller Powerpoint

1. 298; 1085-7. Streamboats up to Dome
Littlefield Report, 1998 (Exhibit 1, part 19)
Littlefield Testimony, 2005, Transcript @ p. 154:6
Littlefield Report, 2005 (Exhibit 12, p. 120)
Newspaper accounts. AZ Sentinel 1-25-1879. "Uncle Sam" (Exhibit X004, part 15)
2. 330-1. Pattie description of Gila.
SLIDE 80 - James Ohio Pattie (1825, Jan-Mar)
 - a. All Segments: "beautiful, running between banks with tall cottonwoods & willows...plenty of beaver" (Tellman, Arizona's Changing Rivers (Exhibit 1, part 18), citing Corle, The Gila, p. 116-119)
 - b. Segment 7: "200 yds wide" (Man and Wildlife in Arizona, Goode P. Davis, Jr., 1982, p. 8, 19-20 (Exhibit X004, part 3))
 - c. Segment 6: "too deep to ford"
 - i. Built a canoe to trap both sides of river (Exhibit X004, p. 21)
3. 331-2. Kearny Expedition quote.
Kearny Expedition (1846) – Mapping, Roads
Segment 7:
"80 yds wide...3 ft deep...rapid" (Exhibit X004, Part3, 29)
Lt. Emory (1846): "Navigable as far as Pima Villages (Segment 6)...possibly with small boats at all stages" (Littlefield, 2004, Exhibit 12, p. 108)
Lt. Emory (1853): "Not navigable...a never failing stream...large volume of flow...large fish" (Exhibit 12, p. 108)
Turner: "100-150 yds wide...average depth of 4 ft...deep enough for a steamboat" (Exhibit X004, part 3, p. 29; Exhibit 12, p. 107)
Segment 1:
Johnson: "30 ft wide, 1 ft. deep on the shallows, pebbly bed, fringed with trees." (Exhibit X004, part 3, p. 27)
4. 332. Source for quote on SLIDE 83.
Forty-Niners
Segment 6:
"deep, narrow & rapid stream" (Exhibit 1, part 18, p. 99)
"whole stream drawn off for irrigation" (Exhibit X004, part 3, p 44)
August, 1849 "deep, narrow, rapid, muddy, tall cottonwoods" (Exhibit X004, part 3, p 48)
Segment 1:
"12 yds wide, 1.5 ft deep...abounds in trout" (Exhibit X004, part 3, p 47)
5. 334-5. Source for Gila River in Duncan Valley in SLIDE 91 (ASLD Report for Upper Gila River, Exhibit 2, p. B-17; AZ Pioneers Historical Society, Tucson, #59101)
6. 486. Escalante description. SLIDE 79
de Escalante (Nov, 1697)
Segment 6
River too deep to ford, crossed by swimming (ASLD Report for Gila River, 2005, Exhibit 4, p. IV-1)
de Anza (1775)
Segment 6, 7 & 8
"dry...half way up legs...reaching horses' shoulders...very deep...flowing slowly" (ASLD Report for Gila River, 2005, Exhibit 4, p. IV-1)