1	BEFORE THE					
2	ARIZONA NAVIGABLE STREAM ADJUDICATION COMMISSION					
3						
4	IN THE MATTER OF THE NAVIGABILITY )					
5	OF THE VERDE RIVER FROM ITS ) NO. 04-009-NAV HEADWATERS AT SULLIVAN LAKE TO )					
6	THE CONFLUENCE WITH THE SALT ) ADMINISTRATIVE RIVER, YAVAPAI, GILA AND MARICOPA ) HEARING					
7	COUNTIES, ARIZONA. )					
8						
9						
10	At: Phoenix, Arizona					
11	Date: February 25, 2015					
12	Filed: March 17, 2015					
13						
14	REPORTER'S TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS					
15	VOLUME 11					
16	Pages 2348 through 2522, Inclusive					
17						
18						
19						
20						
21	COASH & COASH, INC. Court Reporting, Video & Videoconferencing					
22	1802 N. 7th Street, Phoenix, AZ 85006 602-258-1440 mh@coashandcoash.com					
23	Prepared by:					
24	Jody L. Lenschow, RMR, CRR Certificate No. 50192					
25	CCICILICACC NO. JULY2					
	COASH & COASH, INC. 602-258-1440 www.coashandcoash.com Phoenix, AZ					

1	INDEX TO EXAMINATIONS	
2	WITNESS	PAGE
3	JACK L. AUGUST, JR.	
4		0252
5	CONTINUED DIRECT EXAMINATION BY MS. CAMPBELL CROSS-EXAMINATION BY MR. HOOD CROSS-EXAMINATION BY MS. HERNBRODE	2353 2426 2428
6	CROSS-EXAMINATION BY MR. HELM	2502
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

602-258-1440 Phoenix, AZ

- 1 CROSS-EXAMINATION
- 2 BY MS. HERNBRODE:
- Q. Good afternoon, Dr. August.
- 4 A. Good afternoon.
- 5 Q. We haven't met formally.
- 6 A. No.
- 7 Q. But I'm Joy Hernbrode.
- 8 A. Joy, okay.
- 9 Q. You can call me Joy.
- 10 A. Joy, thank you.
- 11 Q. Ms. Hernbrode is just --
- 12 A. Jack.
- 13 (An off-the-record discussion ensued.)
- 14 BY MS. HERNBRODE:
- 15 Q. I think we've established that you're going
- 16 to call me Joy and I'm going to call you Jack.
- 17 A. Correct.
- 18 Q. All right. I'm going to start with your CV a
- 19 little bit. Is it fair to say that much of your
- 20 writings focus on the political history of Arizona post
- 21 about the 1920s and the history of various water
- 22 conflicts?
- 23 A. Yes.
- Q. Is that because that's where your main
- 25 interest lies?

- 1 A. I'm interested in all of it, but I like some
- 2 of the topics that -- in the 20th century, yes.
- Q. Are there any good books out there you could
- 4 recommend on territorial political history of Arizona?
- 5 A. Sure. I would start with Volume 2 of Jay J.
- 6 Wagoner's Arizona history; I think Thomas Farish of
- 7 1918; McClintock's, about the same time; Thomas
- 8 Sheridan, his most recent revision of the Arizona
- 9 history. While I like Marshall Trimble, I wouldn't
- 10 recommend Marsh for kind of any serious kind of
- 11 scholarly work. And then there's a host of kind of
- 12 articles in the Arizona History and other scholarly
- 13 works that cover the naming of Arizona, to all types of
- 14 political and political developments in Arizona.
- 15 Q. Would you call your current report here
- 16 comprehensive, or did you have sort of a limited focus?
- 17 A. I had a very limited focus.
- 18 Q. And I think you said that your limited focus
- 19 was the Verde in its ordinary and natural condition,
- 20 which I think you said was about 1866, correct?
- 21 A. 1866, 1870, you know, yes, beginning of
- 22 development.
- O. There's no firm --
- 24 A. No firm --
- 25 Q. -- date there?

- 1 A. No firm date.
- 2 Q. Right.
- Would it be common for a historian to include
- 4 a list of works cited in their report?
- 5 A. Yes, but I used the just footnotes to cite.
- 6 And the idea of comprehensive bibliographies in terms
- 7 of academic and scholarly publications in history is --
- 8 it's so erratic, it's kind of receding into history,
- 9 that many editors -- and I think it may have to do with
- 10 costs. Those extensive bibliographies that kind of
- 11 characterize my book on Hayden and others in my recent
- 12 works, they don't have bibliographies, and they just
- 13 rely on your end notes for sources cited. But that may
- 14 be a stylistic thing.
- 15 Q. Okay. Are all the documents you relied on
- 16 listed in your report?
- 17 A. No, not necessarily, but they were some of
- 18 the most obvious, since it was so brief and I became
- 19 part of this family rather recently, so...
- 20 Q. Did you review the Land Department's report?
- 21 A. I've reviewed it in part. I haven't had
- 22 time, but I will after this. I'll have some time.
- O. Mr. Fuller's latest PowerPoint?
- 24 A. I've reviewed it. I have a copy of it and
- 25 was able to take a look at it. But to review it

- comprehensively like I would like to do, I have not had 1
- 2 the time.
- 3 Were you here when Mr. Fuller was testifying? Ο.
- 4 No, not at this one. I didn't catch him. Α.
- may have caught a half a day, but not very much. But 5
- I've seen him testify in the past on another 6
- 7 watercourse.
- 8 And were you provided with transcripts of Ο.
- 9 Mr. Fuller's testimony?
- 10 Α. Not yet.
- 11 Did you rely on any other reports from Ο.
- 12 experts in this case?
- Not for this report, no, not -- and, again, 13 Α.
- 14 I'm catching up and trying to review things as I go
- 15 along here.
- Okay. So you didn't rely on Dr. Littlefield? 16 Ο.
- 17 Α. No, no. But I'm familiar with
- Dr. Littlefield's work and his area of expertise with 18
- 19 surveying and the history of surveying and that; but I
- have not seen his work in this regard, and I think the 20
- 21 point was that I provide some other material besides
- 22 that, just to add to the record for the Commission.
- 23 And you must have looked at at least portions Ο.
- 24 of Mr. Burtell's report to get the segments at least?
- 25 Yeah. Yeah, the segments. I think it was I Α.

- 1 read 20 pages and then just very quickly reviewed the
- 2 end note material, including the Joseph Pratt Allyn
- 3 book that he used. And so I guess I was most
- 4 interested not in the technical work that other people
- 5 are providing, but I was interested in some of his
- 6 historical references and just to see how he would use
- 7 those.
- 8 O. So given those answers, I guess I'm a little
- 9 confused when you say you reviewed the complete
- 10 historic record. The complete historic record of what,
- 11 I guess is the question?
- 12 A. The historical record of what I was charged
- 13 with reviewing for this Segments 4 and 5. If I had,
- 14 and I will have, some more months, then it will really
- 15 truly be comprehensive, and I can even venture to do
- 16 some work in Segments 1, 2, and 3.
- 17 Q. Did you look at any evidence that's in the
- 18 record from the 1870 and prior period?
- 19 A. No evidence in this record, no.
- 20 Q. So I think what you're saying is that you
- 21 relied a lot on your expertise in this area, stuff that
- 22 you've looked at over the course of your career?
- 23 A. Oh, that's correct. Yeah. I was familiar
- 24 with the secondary sources, where the primary sources
- 25 are located, and I looked for any accounts of boating

- 1 or trade up and down the river, but particularly with
- 2 Segments 4 and 5.
- Q. And it looks to be like you primarily relied
- 4 upon books, though a few newspaper accounts were also
- 5 included?
- 6 A. That's right. That explains the brevity and
- 7 the kind of contracted time frame. But, believe me, I
- 8 do the long form usually. I mean the books are long.
- 9 Q. And I take it then that you believe that
- 10 those sources are reliable?
- 11 A. They are, they're reliable.
- 12 Q. Even though they were, in some cases,
- 13 secondary sources?
- 14 A. Secondary sources in that field, in the
- 15 borderlands field, are really quite, in my opinion,
- 16 reliable.
- 17 Q. And newspaper reports, reliable?
- 18 A. You have to read those very carefully,
- 19 critically, and analytically, particularly from around
- 20 the turn of the century. And even in my work on
- 21 Senator Hayden, for example, in 1912, when he
- 22 arrested -- it's a little bit after the time frame, but
- 23 when he arrested two train robbers in 1910, the
- 24 verbiage was over the top on how exciting it was and
- 25 all that. It was much more mundane.

- 1 They tend to make things sound a little more Ο.
- 2 exciting than they actually were?
- That's a function of the time. Yeah. 3
- 4 So when you opine that none of the five Ο.
- 5 segments of the Verde River were navigable, would it be
- perhaps more correct to state that you found, from the 6
- 7 historical records you looked at, that the Verde River
- 8 was not navigated?
- 9 Α. It was not navigated.
- 10 Okay. Would you agree that there are lots of Ο.
- 11 reasons that someone might not use a river to travel
- 12 on?
- 13 There might be a lot of reasons, sure. Α.
- 14 I believe some that Mr. Randall, who Q.
- 15 testified here previously, mentioned, you didn't have
- the technology to build a boat? 16
- 17 Α. I remember that testimony.
- 18 Q. Would you agree with that?
- 19 That his people, for example, are you saying, Α.
- 20 the Apache people?
- 21 Q. Yes.
- If Mr. Randall said it, I would consider the 22
- 23 source and I would, at first blush, I would agree with
- 24 him.
- The river doesn't go where you want it to go? 25 Ο.

## VERDE RIVER VOLUME 11 02/25/2015

- It doesn't go where I -- I don't --1 Α.
- 2 I believe Mr. Randall testified his people Ο.
- 3 traded with the Hopi. The Verde doesn't go to Hopi,
- 4 does it?
- No. No, it does not. 5 Α.
- 6 Q. So that would be a good reason not to use the
- 7 river?
- 8 Α. That would be a reason not to use it, why it
- 9 would be excluded, yes.
- 10 The river doesn't take a direct route? Ο.
- 11 Α. It does not.
- 12 And that would be a reason not to use the Q.
- 13 river?
- 14 I don't think about that. I don't see, if it Α.
- 15 were navigable, if it were in kind of a slight
- reverse C, like it is, I don't think that would 16
- 17 preclude someone moving from Point A to Point B on that
- 18 river.
- 19 So you would disagree with Mr. Randall on Ο.
- 20 that particular point?
- 21 Α. On that particular point, yeah, I would
- 22 respectfully disagree.
- 23 Some other reasons, you've got a horse and Ο.
- 24 the horse doesn't want to get on a boat?
- 25 That might be a reason. Α.

- 1 Q. You're tracking people who don't use boats?
- 2 A. In my report and --
- 3 O. Well --
- 4 A. Yeah.
- 5 Q. -- would that be a reason not to use a boat?
- 6 A. Oh.
- 7 Q. If your purpose there were to be to track
- 8 some people who were not using a boat, would that be a
- 9 good reason not to use a boat?
- 10 A. You would not use a boat, no.
- 11 Q. Would it be a good reason not to use a boat
- 12 if the boat would mean you arrive at a predictable
- 13 place at a predictable time and you're being tracked by
- 14 some people who were trying to kill you?
- 15 A. I agree with that statement.
- 16 Q. Would it be a reason not to use a boat if you
- 17 need to go upstream?
- 18 A. Yes, that would be a reason not to use it.
- 19 Q. It's a little more difficult to go upstream
- 20 than down?
- 21 A. Correct.
- 22 O. Would it be a reason not to use a boat if the
- 23 country is fairly open and easy to navigate on foot or
- 24 on horseback?
- 25 A. Correct.

VERDE RIVER VOLUME 11 02/25/2015 2437

- 1 Ο. And would it be a good reason not to use a
- 2 boat if you're exploring and need to look at multiple
- 3 watersheds?
- 4 Α. Correct.
- 5 Okay. I'm going to draw a little bit on, Ο.
- 6 hopefully, your expertise as a western historian.
- 7 Α. Okav.
- 8 What kind of boats were used for trade and Ο.
- 9 travel purposes around the time of Arizona statehood?
- 10 I'll give you some examples, if you don't
- 11 want to come up with one.
- 12 Well, maybe Lingenfelter, you know, I would Α.
- 13 cite that source, and there were paddle wheels, there
- 14 were steamers on the Colorado, and that's
- well-documented and celebrated. I think there were 15
- 16 canoes.
- 17 Q. Kayaks?
- 18 Α. Kayaks, I would suspect. I don't know.
- 19 Flatboats of various types? Ο.
- Flatboats would be something that's part of 20 Α.
- 21 the American travel lexicon, yes.
- 22 Ο. Home-built boats?
- 23 Home-built boats, I would agree that there Α.
- 24 might be some home-built boats.
- 25 Mail-order boats? 0.

2438

- 1 A. Mail-order boats from Sears.
- 2 Q. Canvas canoes?
- 3 A. I'm assuming canvas canoes would be possible,
- 4 would be in the landscape.
- 5 Q. Dugout canoes?
- 6 A. Dugout canoes.
- 7 O. Rubber boats?
- 8 A. I don't know about rubber boats. I'm not a
- 9 boat expert, but if they were here and they were
- 10 invented and useful in 1912, I suspect there would be
- 11 some in Arizona.
- 12 Q. I believe it was Ives' expedition crossing
- 13 the Colorado had a rubber boat.
- 14 A. Did he have rubber boats? I did not know
- 15 that.
- 16 Q. I could be wrong about the expedition. It
- 17 was one of the early --
- 18 A. Early 1850s?
- 19 O. Yeah.
- 20 A. Okay.
- 21 Q. Would any of those small boats be
- 22 particularly useful for hauling a horse?
- 23 A. No, they would not.
- Q. Do you know the navigability requirements of
- 25 any of those boats?

- 1 Α. I do not.
- 2 So you would defer to Mr. Fuller for that Ο.
- 3 information?
- 4 Α. Yes, I would.
- 5 Have you seen the video testimony of Mr. Brad Ο.
- Dimock? 6
- I have not. I'm sure I will. 7 Α.
- 8 Ο. What's your definition of commerce?
- Commerce. The selling and purchasing of 9 Α.
- goods, just very briefly. 10
- 11 Ο. I think on the Gila you said something along
- 12 the lines of in commerce, if you can float a log down
- 13 and somehow conduct commerce, float down it, that would
- 14 be navigable. Does that sound about, right?
- 15 Α. I think I said something like that back then,
- 16 yeah.
- 17 Do you disagree with that statement now? Q.
- 18 Α. No, not necessarily.
- 19 So, again, you were looking for actual use of Ο.
- the river? 20
- 21 Α. I was.
- 22 Ο. You didn't really look at whether it could be
- 23 used, whether the river was deep enough, wide enough,
- 24 and obstacles-free enough to support commerce?
- 25 No, I did not look at any of that kind of Α.

- 1 material. I think other experts have addressed that,
- 2 those.
- 3 I notice your report doesn't include any Ο.
- specific descriptions of the Verde by the historical 4
- figures you discuss. They mention the Verde, but they 5
- don't really describe it; is that true? 6
- Α. That's correct. They saw it, they knew it 7
- 8 was there, and I would venture from Camp Verde to where
- 9 it meets the Salt, and that was fairly well-known by
- 10 1780.
- 11 But you don't -- none of the figures you Ο.
- 12 cited specifically described the Verde; they didn't say
- 13 we met the Verde and it was --
- 14 Α. Yes.
- -- 50 feet wide and 4 feet deep or whatever? 15 Ο.
- 16 That's right, and I was looking for that Α.
- 17 specifically.
- So how did you determine whether the river 18
- 19 was susceptible for transportation or commerce?
- I'm not an attorney, and susceptible, I think 20 Α.
- 21 in this instant, is a legal term that will be
- 22 determined by the attorneys and the Commission.
- 23 don't think I should or can talk about the legal
- 24 definition of susceptibility.
- 25 Well, I believe that you state, at least on 0. COASH & COASH, INC. 602-258-1440 www.coashandcoash.com Phoenix, AZ

02/25/2015

- Page 7 of your report, that Kino didn't think the Verde 1
- 2 was susceptible to transportation or commerce?
- Yeah, but he wouldn't even go there, he 3
- 4 didn't even go to the Verde; and I think from their --
- 5 from the rest of that report, it was too far away and
- was not viewed to or susceptible to navigation not in 6
- the legal term, just that why are we going to go there. 7
- 8 We know it's there, we know there's water there, and
- 9 that was it. But to use it as some kind of a
- commercial transportation route, that wasn't even in 10
- 11 question.
- 12 I believe in your direct this afternoon, you Ο.
- 13 talked about the fact that Kino didn't even actually
- 14 get very close to the river; he kind of looked at it
- 15 from pretty high up?
- 16 Α. He looked at it from pretty high up.
- 17 And it was on the wrong side of the Gila for Q.
- them to be really interested in? 18
- 19 Yes. Yeah, the Gila seems to be an important Α.
- barrier, consciously or not, for the Spaniards. 20
- 21 had hopes of establishing some kind of colony/mission
- north of the Gila, but it just never worked out. And 22
- 23 the only way they reached the Hopis, more often than
- 24 not, was from the Santa Fe base and not from Sonora.
- 25 And I think you said you don't have an Ο.

COASH & COASH, INC. 602-258-1440 www.coashandcoash.com Phoenix, AZ

- opinion on the segmentation? 1
- 2 Α. Yeah, I don't.
- You cited to Mr. Burtell's segmentation. 3 Ο.
- 4 assume you don't know how, if at all, it varies from
- 5 the segmentation that the Land Department did?
- No. I'm assuming that -- I assumed that 6 Α.
- 7 Mr. Burtell was using the State Land Department's,
- 8 without having -- and, again, I can't wait to read all
- 9 of them.
- 10 What's your boating experience? 0.
- 11 Α. Zero.
- 12 Really? Q.
- 13 Α. None.
- 14 Q. Okay.
- 15 CHAIRMAN NOBLE: We really appreciate
- that, Jack. 16
- 17 MS. HERNBRODE: I was hoping for --
- CHAIRMAN NOBLE: You have no idea. 18
- 19 THE WITNESS: You know, my buddies would
- 20 go up to Apache Lake or something, but I never -- you
- 21 know, I didn't have time or something like that, so ...
- BY MS. HERNBRODE: 2.2
- 23 You are aware that thousands of people boat Ο.
- 24 the Verde every year, though?
- 25 I'm aware, from the testimony I heard here, Α.

- up around Clarkdale, close to where I live, that that's 1
- 2 an activity that takes place, yes.
- I notice there are no photographs in your 3
- report as well. Did you look for photographs or other 4
- early evidence of what the Verde might have looked 5
- like? 6
- 7 I honestly did not have time, but I will, as Α.
- 8 this proceeds. I do like imagery and illustrations to
- 9 clarify and assist in the narrative, yes; but I have
- not used any up to this point. 10
- 11 Ο. And, likely, any photographs would have
- fallen after that 1870s date? 12
- Well, let's see, photography is invented in 13 Α.
- 14 I think there's some de Guerra types in the
- 15 Arizona Territory. So I would be very interested. I'm
- very interested in that field, and so I look forward to 16
- 17 uncovering anything that I might find.
- If I tell you that lining your boat involves 18 Ο.
- 19 walking your boat with a rope tied on to it around an
- 20 obstacle, not pulling it upstream, that's a different
- 21 term --
- 22 Α. Oh, okay.
- 23 Q. -- do you have any reason to disagree with
- 24 that?
- I have no reason to disagree with what you 25 Α.

- 1 said.
- Q. You talked for almost three pages about
- 3 Phoenix's use of water from the Verde. It's
- 4 interesting history.
- 5 A. Right.
- 6 Q. But how does that apply to navigability?
- 7 A. Well, I think it has to do with how they --
- 8 Phoenix's interest in those segments of the river.
- 9 Phoenix has an abiding interest in Segments 4 and 5,
- 10 and so that was one of the reasons to take a look at
- 11 this.
- 12 Q. You were trying to explain why your client
- 13 was here at this hearing, but not necessarily to convey
- 14 anything about the navigability of the river?
- 15 A. I think that was it; and, also, to look to
- 16 see if there was any history of navigation that I could
- 17 uncover over the course of my career in looking at this
- 18 reach, and pretty critically and analytically, as well
- 19 as any material I could find.
- 20 Q. And I think Phoenix's interest started in
- 21 about 1907; is that correct?
- 22 A. Phoenix?
- O. Phoenix's interest in the Verde?
- 24 A. Yes, right around there.
- Q. But its predecessors or the people who lived

- in the Phoenix area were taking water before that? 1
- 2 Α. That is correct. They were concerned.
- I think we tend to assume that the Phoenix 3 Ο.
- Metro area has always been sort of the dominant 4
- 5 metropolis we have today, but that wasn't true for a
- lot of Arizona's territorial and preterritorial period, 6
- was it? 7
- 8 Α. It was not. In fact, Phoenix, I think the
- 9 census of 1920, if I'm not mistaken, is the first
- census in which Phoenix has a larger population than 10
- 11 Tucson. And, also, Yuma and the Bisbee area, they
- 12 were -- politicians, for example, if that's a
- 13 barometer, they had better go and talk to the editor of
- 14 the Bisbee News or something in order to get their
- 15 endorsement.
- So they don't play the role that they did 16
- 100 years ago, but, yes, Phoenix was slower to overtake 17
- Tucson. And the rivalry continues to exist, whether 18
- 19 it's over population or lifestyle or whether Phoenix
- was being settled by Anglo-Americans from the East and 20
- 21 Tucson's history goes south to north, you know, the
- 22 different places.
- 23 Or who is going to get their roads repaired? Ο.
- 24 That's true. I agree. Α.
- For a lot of the time Prescott was actually 25 Ο.

602-258-1440 Phoenix, AZ

- 1 more important than Phoenix?
- 2 A. Oh, it was a Territorial Capitol, and we
- 3 still think we're -- no, it's -- yeah, we're -- no, it
- 4 was very important and has found its niche, I think, in
- 5 the pantheon of 21st century micropolis in Arizona.
- 6 Q. I noticed that when you talked about the
- 7 prehistoric people here, particularly in the Phoenix
- 8 area, you called them the Hohokam.
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 Q. Other people have called them the Hohokam.
- 11 A. Hohokam.
- 12 Q. Or the Huhukam.
- 13 A. Uh-huh, sure.
- 14 Q. All the same people, right?
- 15 A. All the same people, that's correct.
- 16 Q. Sort of depends on what your cultural
- 17 background is, how you use that phrase?
- 18 A. Boy, I never -- I have never thought of that.
- 19 I've always heard the term Hohokam, even from
- 20 archaeologists I know and zooarchaeologists as well. I
- 21 have some friends at ASU. And so they've used the term
- 22 Hohokam. But the third one I haven't heard, so thank
- 23 you.
- O. That would be the tribal.
- 25 A. The tribal reference?

- 1 0. Yes, yes.
- 2 Α. Yeah. Not the Aztecs, but the Meshika.
- 3 Okay, I got it.
- 4 Is it fair to say that the question of Ο.
- 5 whether the Hohokam became what we used to call the
- Pima is a matter for scholarly debate, but not one 6
- 7 which the O'odham people themselves debate?
- 8 Α. I think that's a -- the last I've discerned
- 9 and heard of that issue, that's correct.
- 10 They feel pretty strongly they were descended O.
- 11 from those people?
- 12 Α. Yes.
- 13 And the Hopi as well? Ο.
- 14 I have not heard that about the Hopi. Α.
- 15 speak the Uto-Aztecan language. That kind of links
- them down with people on the southern part of the 16
- 17 Colorado River straits.
- And you haven't seen anything in the 18 Ο.
- 19 literature you've reviewed about Hohokam use of boats,
- but that doesn't mean there is evidence you haven't 20
- 21 seen?
- 22 I haven't seen anything, and I relied on the
- 23 classic works of Emil Haury, Doyle, and, you know,
- 24 those people that are the recognized experts.
- 25 In prehistoric times the culture along the 0.

VERDE RIVER VOLUME 11 02/25/2015

- 1 lower Verde was the Hohokam, and in the Verde Valley it
- 2 was the Sinagua?
- 3 A. I think that's correct.
- 4 Q. Where was the dividing point between the two
- 5 cultures; do you know?
- 6 A. I do not.
- 7 Q. Both cultures practiced irrigation?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 O. Were the Hohokam canals more extensive than
- 10 the Sinagua canals?
- 11 A. That seems to be what the research indicates,
- 12 that they were really quite extensive.
- 13 Q. The Sinagua were more into terrace farming?
- 14 A. Terrace farming, that's correct.
- 15 Q. And were the Hohokam canals on the Verde
- 16 system less extensive than those on the Salt or the
- 17 Gila?
- 18 A. From the lower Verde report, which, again, is
- 19 exhaustive, and I don't know how many previous nights
- 20 I've been reading through that, but they were less. I
- 21 think there were 26 sites and less extensive, but still
- 22 a vital civilization during the height.
- Q. When you say the lower Verde report, what are
- 24 you referring to?
- 25 A. It's called the Lower -- it's called

- 1 Vanishing Verde, The Lower Verde Report. It's got a
- 2 very long title, but it's cited here, and you can see
- 3 it online, and it's like I don't know how many volumes.
- 4 Q. Would that be Vanishing River?
- 5 A. Vanishing River, yeah, it's the Vanishing
- 6 River.
- 7 And the interdisciplinary and
- 8 multidisciplinary nature of the report is impressive.
- 9 I don't see -- it was funded by the Bureau of
- 10 Reclamation. That's how it got done.
- 11 Q. Do you know if that report is in evidence as
- 12 Exhibit X017-120?
- 13 A. I found out about that today.
- 14 Q. Okay. When Mr. Randall testified about the
- 15 earliest people in the Verde Valley, he was likely
- 16 talking about the Sinagua, then, and not the Hohokam?
- 17 A. I would think so, yes, from his discussion.
- 18 Q. And I believe you said scholars don't agree
- 19 about why the Sinagua and the Hohokam cultures
- 20 declined?
- 21 A. I think that's a fair statement, yes.
- 22 O. If the Hohokam had built boats, what do you
- 23 think they would have been made of?
- 24 A. I can't speculate about that. I really don't
- 25 know.

- 1 O. Reeds?
- 2 A. Perhaps.
- 3 Q. Logs?
- 4 A. Perhaps.
- 5 Q. Do you know if the Hohokam used bundles of
- 6 reeds for their diversion dams?
- 7 A. Yes, I think that's in evidence.
- 8 Q. So do you think you could tell, if you dug up
- 9 a bundle of reeds, whether it had been part of a dam or
- 10 part of a boat?
- 11 A. I couldn't tell that. I would leave that to
- 12 archaeologists.
- 13 Q. Have you read the draft report on the
- 14 archeological testing for the Sky Harbor Sky Train
- 15 that's been partially funded by your client?
- 16 A. No, I have not.
- 17 Q. Okay. You testified previously on the Gila?
- 18 A. Uh-huh. A long time ago, yes. I forget.
- 19 O. 2005, I believe.
- 20 Are you aware of the prehistoric canoe that
- 21 was reported in a canal in that report and I believe in
- 22 the Salt report?
- 23 A. I am not aware of that canoe.
- Q. Did I hear you say you thought Mr. Randall
- 25 testified about the Yavapai?

- 1 A. He testified a little bit about the
- 2 relationship and the difference in language, languages.
- 3 So he testified a bit about that, yes.
- 4 Q. But his primary testimony, his focus was his
- 5 culture --
- 6 A. His culture.
- 7 O. -- which would be Apache?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 O. You relied on Mr. Bolton's work for
- 10 information about Father Kino?
- 11 A. And others, but, yeah, that's kind of the
- 12 classic cite; but there are other people that have
- 13 written about Father Kino, of course.
- 14 Q. Did you rely on him for any other parts of
- 15 your report?
- 16 A. Certainly. He's kind of this constant
- 17 eminence in the field of borderlands history, and I
- 18 think I've read almost everything he's ever written.
- 19 I've even read the bio -- I think a historian has a
- 20 biography written on him, but he has a biography
- 21 written by John Francis Bannon. So a major figure in
- 22 the field, yes, and I've read most of his, if not all
- 23 of his work.
- Q. The only place I saw it cited was in the
- 25 reference to Kino.

- 1 A. Yes.
- Q. Are there other places that you --
- 3 A. Oh, he wrote Coronado: Knight of Pueblo and
- 4 Plains. He wrote the big Coronado book. He's written
- 5 shorter pieces on Kino, kind of a synthesis, rather
- 6 than the Rim of Christendom, to make it more
- 7 accessible. And he's written on a variety of other
- 8 topics from presidios to even on some of the
- 9 individuals that were mentioned, like Espejo and
- 10 Farfan. He's covered -- he covered the territory,
- 11 really invented the field, in a way.
- 12 Q. I notice you seem to speak Spanish fairly
- 13 fluently. Do you read it?
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 Q. During the period of time that the Spanish
- 16 were exploring, were horses commonly available
- 17 throughout Arizona?
- 18 A. Yes. The Spanish introduced or reintroduced
- 19 the horse to this continent in around, it looks as
- 20 though, the earliest, 1570. Then some of them get
- 21 away, you know, and then bred. So we have a few, but
- 22 not many, wild horses in Arizona and then through the
- 23 plains. And they were quickly acquired by the Comanche
- 24 people, for example, and used as a dimension of their
- 25 war tactics. Other groups didn't; used them as food.

- 1 O. Because I thought you said, when we were
- 2 talking about the trappers, that sometimes they lost
- 3 their horses or had to eat their horses.
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 Q. And it didn't seem like they had a ready
- 6 source for replacing their horses.
- 7 A. Their horses, for the most part, up in what
- 8 we're talking about, from Taos and Santa Fe, they had
- 9 ready supplies of horses and ranches and where their
- 10 embarkation point or disembarkation point was at.
- 11 Q. But if they ate their horse in Arizona --
- 12 A. They would be in big trouble.
- 13 Q. -- or misplaced their horse because the
- 14 Apache ran off with it --
- 15 A. That's correct, and that happened, and then
- 16 you were a pedestrian.
- 17 Q. And so if the Spanish had gotten to a river
- 18 that they could put a canoe on and they've got their
- 19 horse there or they've got the canoe, would they just
- 20 turn that horse loose and go on down the river, or does
- 21 it make sense to keep ahold of the beast of burden you
- 22 have right here?
- 23 A. I think 99 to 100 percent of the time, I
- 24 think they would keep the horse. It was a valuable
- 25 asset.

- 1 O. And, generally, Arizona's located up or
- 2 downstream from Mexico?
- A. Generally, it's located upstream; but we do
- 4 have some watercourses that flow from Mexico to the
- 5 United States. I think the Santa Cruz starts in the
- 6 U.S., goes underneath, and then circles back, yeah.
- 7 Q. And if you're exploring an area you know is
- 8 arid and you want to explore across multiple
- 9 watersheds, would it be easier to ride a horse or use a
- 10 boat?
- 11 A. Ride a horse.
- 12 Q. How many Spanish explorers do you discuss in
- 13 your report? Because I had counted five, and then I
- 14 heard Ms. Campbell mention ten, and it's entirely
- 15 possible that I can't count that much.
- 16 A. And there are several others I could have
- 17 mentioned; Father Segesser, Father Pfefferkorn. I
- 18 think I mentioned Sedelmayr only because I think I had
- 19 to be selective and brief, and I wanted to use the most
- 20 representative of those who may have had contact or
- 21 went beyond the Gila River at some point. But there
- 22 were others, many others; many of them with German
- 23 names, and some of the military people, like Alejandro
- 24 O'Reilly and Hugo O'Conor. It's kind of a
- 25 multinational frontier that are in the service of

- 1 Spain. But I didn't mention them.
- Q. Okay. And we're getting into dangerous
- 3 ground here. I should tell you now that I had to take
- 4 American Sign Language in college as my second language
- 5 because my pronunciation of all languages is so bad.
- 6 A. Okay.
- 7 Q. So with that in mind, please bear with me.
- 8 A. Okay.
- 9 Q. The first Spaniard you talked about came with
- 10 Farfan as his biographer or his diarist, I guess?
- 11 A. Oh, there was a diarist with Farfan. Is that
- 12 what you're saying?
- 13 Q. Yeah, yeah. He was the diarist for --
- 14 A. Diego de Luján?
- 15 Q. Es --
- 16 A. Or Espejo?
- 17 Q. Yes.
- 18 A. Espejo.
- 19 O. Espejo?
- 20 A. Yeah.
- Q. Does that sound right?
- 22 A. Yeah. Mirror.
- Q. Okay. And what was Espejo doing in Arizona?
- 24 A. He was -- technically, he was illegal,
- 25 illegal in Arizona. He was the person who agreed to

- 1 save two Franciscan priests who were left behind by a
- 2 previous expedition. Everyone left them, and they left
- 3 them up there, and so the Franciscan Bishop, the head
- 4 Franciscan in Durango, was outraged and wanted them
- 5 returned.
- 6 And so he was on a rescue expedition in 1583,
- 7 and he took advantage of his situation and went
- 8 exploring, because of the persistent rumors of myth of
- 9 gold, Seven Cities of Cibola, Estrecho de Anián, what's
- 10 called Gran Quivira. That was another myth. There's a
- 11 variety of them. Some of them are passageways to the
- 12 Orient and some of them are, in fact, supposedly
- 13 treasures.
- 14 So he went looking for them, and through
- 15 contact with the Hopis and others as he headed west, he
- 16 learned of what might be precious minerals and, thus,
- 17 he ends up traversing in 1583.
- 18 Q. Where did he end up finding the guys he was
- 19 looking for?
- 20 A. He ended up around Jerome and traded for rugs
- 21 and a few things and then went back and subsequently
- 22 became obscure, and then unfortunately for him,
- 23 Oñate -- he wanted to go back and colonize, but Oñate a
- 24 few years later got the contract to colonize and become
- 25 Captain General of New Mexico. But that was his

- 1 overall ambition, so...
- 2 Q. So he didn't find the two gentlemen he was
- 3 sent to look for?
- 4 A. They were dead.
- 5 Q. Okay.
- 6 A. There was three altogether, actually.
- 7 O. And where did he start from?
- 8 A. He started from Santa Bárbara, which is, I
- 9 guess, today in Chihuahua, and it became a big silver
- 10 mining frontier, kind of a wild west, like the
- 11 Tombstone of the central corridor of the Spanish
- 12 advance from south to north. And so he started there.
- 13 That was where they took off, and you race up the
- 14 Rio Grande Valley, and then he turned left.
- 15 Q. And did he use any rivers on his journey?
- 16 A. He did not. He did not use any rivers. And
- 17 it was pretty well-documented by the diarist, and he
- 18 subsequently, again, got in trouble and was rebuked.
- 19 O. How many people did he have with him?
- 20 A. I think eight or nine.
- 21 Q. So a relatively small --
- 22 A. Small, small.
- 23 Q. -- Spanish expedition?
- 24 A. Yes, a small expedition.
- Q. Any cattle?

- 1 A. No cattle on this one, no.
- Q. And how long did he spend on the Verde?
- 3 A. I think he crossed the Verde and may have
- 4 spent a matter of weeks, you know, and then came -- a
- 5 matter of weeks.
- 6 Q. And you didn't find any specific description
- 7 of the river from him?
- 8 A. No, there's no description of the river,
- 9 other than there were rivers that they crossed, and
- 10 so...
- 11 But that was it.
- 12 Q. Did you read his primary account?
- 13 A. Yes, I've read it in the past, yeah.
- 14 Q. A while ago?
- 15 A. Yeah. But I also take a look at the English
- 16 translation recently, because it was the most -- the
- 17 handiest.
- 18 Q. And I think the next explorer you talked
- 19 about was Oñate?
- 20 A. Juan de Oñate after -- yeah, Juan de Oñate is
- 21 the founder of what is now New Mexico, and he was the
- 22 first -- he got the contract in 1598 to colonize and
- 23 govern and advance the frontier. And he was given a
- 24 good contract, but, again, you know, he wasn't paid.
- 25 He financed it.

- 1 Q. So he was looking for settlement sites?
- 2 A. Yes, he went up to settle. So it's a much
- 3 larger force. There are civilians, which is different
- 4 than the previous expeditions up there.
- 5 And so the site they went to is actually
- 6 north of Santa Fe, north, oh, about 30 miles toward
- 7 Taos, if you go on the road today, and it's called the
- 8 San Juan Pueblo, and they called it Gaypa, G-A-Y-P-A.
- 9 And then it was relocated in 1690 because he didn't
- 10 fulfill his contract, according to the King, and the
- 11 King put his own guy there and it became a royal
- 12 province.
- 13 Q. And so how many people, approximately, did he
- 14 have with him?
- 15 A. Probably -- he had about 100 mixed; more
- 16 military men, 50 to 100 military; and cattle.
- 17 Q. How long did he stay on the Verde?
- 18 A. He didn't stay on the Verde at all. He went
- 19 in 1604. He crossed it looking for the Sea of -- the
- 20 South Sea, which is really a reference to the Pacific
- 21 Ocean, because of communication from the natives to the
- 22 west.
- 23 And so after Farfan came back, his first --
- 24 the first guy he wanted to take a look at and was
- unsuccessful, by 1604 he's getting kind of desperate,

- 1 because there was no gold or silver, mineral, and New
- 2 Mexico was -- I think today is the 44th state that was
- 3 poor in natural resources. And so he went to try to
- 4 save his charge, and was unsuccessful, but he did try
- 5 to get to the South Sea, as they called it, and he got
- 6 to the Colorado River and saw it.
- 7 Q. Do you know where, approximately, he crossed
- 8 the Verde?
- 9 A. Often the passageway was along the Gila.
- 10 They went south and used the Gila, because there's
- 11 water, so they --
- 12 Q. Where did he cross the Verde, though?
- 13 A. Oh, he crossed the Verde close to where
- 14 Clarkdale would be, between Camp Verde and where
- 15 Clarkdale is.
- 16 O. And did he leave any records about what he
- 17 saw when he crossed the Verde?
- 18 A. No. It was just an obstacle to travel, so he
- 19 crossed.
- 20 Q. And then we have Kino, who only saw the river
- 21 sort of from far away?
- 22 A. Yeah. Yeah, I think that's --
- Q. And then Nentvig?
- 24 A. Nentvig, yes. Yeah, one of the later
- 25 Jesuits.

- 1 Q. And what was his purpose in Arizona?
- 2 A. He was there to consolidate all the
- 3 information. He was a missionary, but many of these
- 4 missionaries wore several hats, like Kino, and he
- 5 produced a pretty scholarly volume.
- 6 And I'll look up Rudo Ensayo and it is a real
- 7 solid laundry list of the natural resources, the
- 8 mountain ranges, the people, the vegetation, the
- 9 animals, and what was there. It's what Americans did
- 10 in the 19th century, and if you read William
- 11 Geotzmann's Exploration and Empire, which won the
- 12 Pulitzer Prize in '67 -- and he didn't even get tenure
- 13 at Yale; geez. -- but that's a great account of
- 14 America's scientific dimension to study.
- 15 So he was an early-day kind of scientist, in
- 16 a way, and evaluated what was there.
- 17 Q. Sort of an early version of the great surveys
- 18 of the American West?
- 19 A. There you go. Yeah. Agreed.
- 20 Q. So how long did he spend on the Verde?
- 21 A. No time on the Verde.
- Q. Okay. So we don't have a description from
- 23 him of the Verde yet?
- A. No. That it was there, and he relied on
- 25 previous descriptions of it.

- Which basically said there's this river? Ο.
- 2 Α. There's this river.
- All right. And then -- oh, boy -- Sedelmayr? 3 Ο.
- 4 Α. Sedelmayr, yeah.
- 5 Q. Okay.

- The Father of the Papago, according to John 6 Α.
- Francis Bannon, but now that term is not used. Papago 7
- 8 actually is kind of, I think, bean-eaters, Papábotas.
- But, you know, their name has changed. But he did a 9
- lot of work among those people and was a very astute, 10
- 11 religious Jesuit.
- 12 So his focus was really down around Tucson? Q.
- 13 Yes, and that's about as far as -- I think I Α.
- 14 said before, that's about as far as, I think, they got
- advancing the frontier. 15
- 16 Ο. Okav. So that's five.
- 17 The other five folks that I failed to count,
- did any of them spend time on the Verde? 18
- 19 No, none of them did. Α.
- And even those who did, they're sort of 20 Q.
- 21 pictures of a river at a particular point in time; they
- 22 didn't settle on the Verde; they didn't spend a lot of
- 23 time there?
- 24 That's correct. Α.
- Did the early Spanish bring ships up the 25 Ο.

- 1 Colorado?
- 2 A. There was seafaring expeditions, yes.
- 3 Q. What years?
- 4 A. The 1580s was when they realized that that
- 5 was a significant watercourse. But in terms of
- 6 establishing a settlement there, it wasn't until 1781.
- 7 Father Garcés, after he had led the expedition in 1776,
- 8 colonizing what is Monterey and San Francisco, they
- 9 lent people from Tucson, and they went overland and all
- 10 that, and then they came back and tried to make a
- 11 settlement, but the Yumans, they massacred them in
- 12 1781. So there was an attempt later on in the Spanish
- 13 period.
- 14 Q. And they actually sailed oceangoing vessels
- 15 up the Colorado?
- 16 A. They tried, yes, with some success but not
- 17 very much.
- 18 Q. Is it possible that a navigable river existed
- 19 in the area explored by the Spanish and they chose, for
- 20 some reason, not to boat it?
- 21 A. I can't answer that one. I'm trying to
- 22 think. Is it possible?
- Q. Well, I think you said that if you've got a
- 24 horse --
- 25 A. Yeah.

- 1 Q. -- you're not going to turn him loose.
- 2 A. Yeah.
- 3 Q. You're not going to put him in a canoe or a
- 4 flatboat.
- 5 A. Yeah, it just doesn't seem that they did.
- 6 Q. Okay. You quote Manje on Page 7 of your
- 7 report.
- 8 A. Manje, yeah, his name is Manje.
- 9 Q. Manje, thank you.
- In that quote, the small stream that he's
- 11 referring to is the White and Black Rivers, not the
- 12 Verde, correct?
- Can you turn to Page 7 of your report?
- 14 A. Well, okay, yeah. Yeah, I'm thinking.
- 15 Q. Can you turn to Page 7? It's not
- 16 horrifically clear, but I think he's talking about the
- 17 headwaters of the Salt.
- 18 A. "This Salado River runs from east to west and
- 19 to the south of the Verde River and they merge, as I
- 20 have said. To the very end and to the most easterly
- 21 point of this Pimería there are also two rivers called,
- 22 more properly, arroyos or small streams."
- 23 That's what the sentence says in Spanish and
- 24 in the translation, so I can't speculate if it was the
- 25 White and the Red River. I don't think you could see

## VERDE RIVER VOLUME 11 02/25/2015

- it from the top of the White and the Black River; I
- 2 don't think you could see it from Estrella Mountain.
- 3 So do you think the small stream he's talking
- 4 about is the Verde?
- No, I think -- no. 5 Α.
- 6 "Of the Verde River and they merge, as I have
- said." 7
- 8 No, not talking -- those two small streams
- 9 are not the Verde.
- 10 Okay. Did any of the Spanish observers cited O.
- 11 in your report make any statements about the
- 12 navigability of the Verde?
- 13 I understand that you've taken from their
- 14 lack of statements --
- 15 Α. Yeah.
- -- an implication, but did they say anything? 16 0.
- 17 Α. No, they did not asssertively say anything.
- 18 CHAIRMAN NOBLE: Joy, can we take a
- 19 break here?
- 20 MS. HERNBRODE: I would love to.
- 21 CHAIRMAN NOBLE: Thank you.
- 22 Fifteen.
- 23 (A recess was taken from 3:30 p.m. to
- 24 3:45 p.m.)
- 25 CHAIRMAN NOBLE: Let's have it.

COASH & COASH, INC. www.coashandcoash.com

602-258-1440 Phoenix, AZ

- 1 BY MS. HERNBRODE:
- Q. All right. You talk a lot about the lack of
- 3 accurate maps of the Verde in your report.
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 Q. Was the technology available at that time,
- 6 did that make it a little bit difficult to have an
- 7 accurate map?
- 8 A. Sure. Cartographers of the 17th and
- 9 18th Century also had to have, maybe, an artistic flare
- 10 or another ability to get perspective and meaning. So
- 11 there's a lack of technology, it's an accurate
- 12 statement. There was a lack of technology, correct.
- 13 Q. You didn't have the aerial overflights, so if
- 14 you didn't see it yourself, you were pretty much
- 15 guessing?
- 16 A. That's correct.
- 17 Q. Was there any other reason other than the
- 18 lack of accurate maps that you conclude the Spanish
- 19 felt the Verde was nonnavigable?
- 20 A. Were there other reasons?
- 21 Q. Yes.
- 22 A. I think so. I think that's just one point
- 23 that I found striking to the map, the map section. You
- 24 know, and I'm, frankly, pretty puzzled by it. I was
- 25 very surprised that some of the maps, even in the late

- 1 19th Century, after 1850, let's say, that they were off
- 2 until they -- they finally got it right, but that took
- 3 time.
- 4 Q. And you have actually looked at the maps
- 5 created by the various Spanish explorers?
- 6 A. Yes, and they're available in a variety of
- 7 texts and others, other sources. And today, I think,
- 8 you know, with digitizing, they're becoming more
- 9 available to the general public.
- 10 Q. Have you looked at them recently?
- 11 A. Not recently; but after this proceeding I'm
- 12 going to look at every one of them carefully, other
- 13 than these that I looked at from the Rumsey collection.
- 14 Q. You should probably quit angling to come back
- 15 to this hearing.
- 16 A. Oh, not this one. No, I just know this is
- 17 going to go on, so...
- 18 Q. Do you recall if those maps showed a single
- 19 or multiple channels of the Verde?
- 20 A. No, I don't. I don't recall.
- 21 Q. Do you recall if they showed any marshes?
- 22 A. No.
- Q. And you didn't include copies of those maps
- 24 in your report?
- 25 A. No, no visuals for this.

- 1 O. Would it be fair to say that none of the
- 2 accounts you're aware of of the Spanish talked about
- 3 the Verde in any detail or described using boats on the
- 4 river?
- 5 A. That's correct.
- 6 Q. All right. Let's move on to mountain men.
- 7 A. Yeah, Taos Trappers, yeah.
- 8 Q. You referenced David Weber's Taos Trappers,
- 9 correct?
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 Q. Did you look at anything else from Mr. Weber?
- 12 A. Yes. I looked at his works, The Spanish in
- 13 North America and The Mexican Frontier in the
- 14 Southwest. He has two big volumes that are large
- 15 syntheses of the period. I think that grew out of his
- 16 doctoral dissertation at the University of New Mexico.
- 17 Q. And The Taos Trapper doesn't talk a lot about
- 18 trappers who were in Arizona, does it?
- 19 A. Not too much.
- Q. It's primarily focused on, really, the
- 21 aspects of trade that were happening in New Mexico?
- 22 A. That's correct.
- Q. What accounts of trappers did you look at
- 24 from folks who were operating in Arizona? It sounds
- 25 like you looked at the Pattie account.

- Pattie, Ewing Young. Tom Sheridan has done a 1 Α.
- 2 nice job of synthesizing that, that period, and so I
- relied on Dr. Sheridan's Arizona: A History, which is, 3
- 4 I think, recognized generally as the authoritative
- source; and he relies on that and other accounts as 5
- well. 6
- 7 Did you look at, I believe, Kit Carson left
- 8 some records?
- 9 Α. Yeah, I've looked at Kit Carson's work, and
- there's been some biographies on Kit Carson, and I've 10
- 11 seen that before, and I'm actually looking at it in
- 12 another proceeding.
- 13 Kit didn't actually write stuff himself, did O.
- 14 he?
- 15 Α. No.
- 16 He had qhostwrites? Ο.
- 17 Α. Many people had ghostwrites, yes, including
- Pattie. 18
- 19 And did he keep notes? O.
- 20 Α. He was not known as a notorious notetaker,
- 21 because he moved constantly. He appears in the Navajo
- 22 frontier in 1868 burning peach trees. I mean he is
- 23 kind of a utility person in furthering the westward
- 24 expansion.
- And for Ewing Young, he left some 25 0.

602-258-1440 Phoenix, AZ

- 1 correspondence, but not really a diary either, correct?
- 2 A. No, no diary, no.
- 3 Q. But Mr. Dye, who traveled with him, kept a
- 4 diary?
- 5 A. Evidently, yes. I've heard about that, yes,
- 6 but I have not looked at it. I've not looked at that
- 7 source.
- 8 Q. Okay. The beaver trappers operating in
- 9 Arizona generally came from Taos or Santa Fe, correct?
- 10 A. Yeah, immediately, yes.
- 11 O. And that's over the Continental Divide from
- 12 the Verde?
- 13 A. Correct.
- 14 Q. So there's no river that runs between the
- 15 two?
- 16 A. No, there's not.
- 17 Q. And even if there were, it would have been a
- 18 little harder to disquise where they were going if they
- 19 were taking a water route, correct?
- 20 A. Yes, and oftentimes that was necessary to
- 21 disguise where they were going. They sometimes took
- 22 off north or northeast to disguise where they were
- 23 going.
- Q. Were trappers and mountain men operating in
- 25 the American West generally literate?

- 1 A. No, that would be the exception to the rule.
- Q. We don't have a lot of accounts from trappers
- 3 operating anywhere in the west?
- 4 A. That's correct. There's a paucity of
- 5 material.
- 6 Q. There's a fair amount of material for
- 7 trappers who were part of the big operations operating
- 8 out of St. Louis and places like that?
- 9 A. Yes, and even Astoria in Oregon, there's some
- 10 good work on that, but that didn't seem relevant here.
- 11 Q. Taos didn't have that kind of one big company
- 12 that controlled everybody and really kept track of
- 13 things?
- 14 A. No. In many ways, Taos kind of reflects the
- 15 essence of American expansion, which was individual
- 16 freedom and initiative.
- 17 Q. I think you said in the 1820s through 1848 or
- 18 so, it wasn't legal for Arizonans to trap in Arizona?
- 19 A. Americans, you mean?
- 20 Q. Yes.
- 21 A. Yes, with some exceptions, like saving the
- 22 Governor's wife and her daughter and things of that
- 23 nature, but -- and more often than not, you know, they
- 24 were skirting the law. They were viewed with
- 25 suspicion, yes.

- 1 Q. You could sometimes get a license if you took
- 2 a Spanish or Mexican citizen with you?
- 3 A. That's correct, yes.
- 4 Q. But most of them didn't bother to do that?
- 5 A. Of course not. No, they did not.
- 6 Q. Were trappers generally protective of their
- 7 methods and trapping locations?
- 8 A. Yes, they were, like miners.
- 9 Q. Particularly if they could be prosecuted by
- 10 Spanish or Mexican authorities for being there?
- 11 A. Correct.
- 12 Q. Have you reviewed the Spanish or Mexican
- 13 records to see if they list any other trapping
- 14 expeditions on the Verde?
- 15 A. For this proceeding, no, but that would be
- 16 something I would certainly do in the future.
- 17 Q. You think it would be a good idea to look at
- 18 those records?
- 19 A. Oh, yeah. I kind of can't wait.
- 20 Q. So the first trapper who left us at least a
- 21 widely distributed account is James Ohio Pattie?
- 22 A. Yes.
- 23 O. And he does record a couple of times where he
- 24 uses a canoe on the Gila and on the Colorado?
- 25 A. I believe that's in there. I wonder --

- again, it's a source that I questioned, given the 1
- 2 exaggeration, so I would question that.
- You question that he used a canoe to trap? 3 Ο.
- 4 Yes, and a variety of other things that he Α.
- 5 asserts in that book.
- Okay. Well, did other trappers in the West 6 Q.
- commonly use a canoe? 7
- 8 Depending on where they were, but I think in Α.
- 9 the West, in this region, no.
- 10 Do you have any expertise in trapping? Ο.
- 11 No, I don't. Oh, God. Α.
- 12 Is Pattie's account a day-by-day account of Q.
- 13 what happened every day?
- 14 Α. Pretty much not. It's impressionistic, and,
- again, the audience was the East Coast urban areas and 15
- 16 to generate money; and Timothy Flint, who wrote it, was
- 17 a skillful writer.
- And the other sources you mentioned, they 18 Ο.
- 19 don't record the sort of day-by-day events --
- 20 Α. No.
- 21 -- of a trapping expedition? Ο.
- 22 Α. But it would be great to have that material.
- 23 Do you recall Pattie saying on the Colorado Ο.
- 24 they made boats, they made dugout canoes?
- 25 I don't recall that, but I would have to Α.

- 1 review the material again.
- Q. Okay. Would it help you if I told you they
- 3 made dugout canoes after their horses were stolen?
- 4 Does that help you place that in the story?
- 5 A. That would help me place it, that would help
- 6 me place it in the story, yes.
- 7 Q. Would you agree that, likely, there were
- 8 hundreds of trappers operating in Arizona?
- 9 A. Hundreds, I wouldn't agree with that.
- 10 Q. How many?
- 11 A. 20 to 30, my guest guesstimate.
- 12 Q. Would you agree that trapping was dangerous?
- 13 A. I would agree that trapping was dangerous.
- 14 Q. You could end up being killed by other
- 15 trappers?
- 16 A. Other trappers, indigenous groups that were
- 17 resentful.
- 18 O. The wildlife?
- 19 A. The wildlife could. Well, perhaps, yes, the
- 20 wildlife. I know the Piipaash people. Yeah, there
- 21 were some tribes that didn't want the Anglos here, and
- 22 wildlife could do it as well, yes.
- Q. Bears?
- A. Bears.
- O. Mountain lions?

- 1 A. Mountain lions. Yikes.
- 2 Q. Oh, my.
- 3 Your take on it is because Pattie didn't
- 4 specifically say he used a canoe on the Verde, that no
- 5 one in his party did?
- 6 A. I'm not saying that. There's just no
- 7 evidence that I've seen that anyone else used a canoe,
- 8 and I was looking for it.
- 9 Q. He doesn't say he did?
- 10 A. He doesn't say, yeah.
- 11 Q. But you don't believe Pattie's memoir is
- 12 particularly accurate?
- 13 A. Not particularly accurate is a good way to
- 14 put it. I think it's impressionistic.
- 15 Q. Okay. And how about the accounts left by
- 16 Carson and Young and Dye?
- 17 A. I think they're in the same category; that
- 18 there's some truth or factual information that
- 19 generated a good story and a fanciful retelling of
- 20 events.
- 21 Q. Would it be more likely for them to
- 22 exaggerate things like Indian encounters? I guess
- 23 today we might call them -- we might say that they sort
- 24 of exaggerate their adrenaline junky activities.
- 25 A. I agree with that.

- 1 0. Okay. So they're less likely to exaggerate
- 2 day-to-day activities?
- 3 I can't say that, but that's something I
- 4 would have to do some research, further research on, to
- 5 make a statement like that.
- 6 Q. Okay.
- 7 Α. Yeah.
- 8 But certainly the encounters with a bear or Ο.
- 9 with a hostile tribe or something like that, those may
- be certainly blown up? 10
- 11 Α. I think that's a good assumption. I think
- 12 it's an accurate assumption.
- 13 Or if you rescued the Governor's daughter --O.
- 14 Α. Yeah.
- 15 -- rather than some poor --Q.
- 16 Α. Yeah.
- 17 Q. -- lass?
- 18 Α. Yeah.
- I would like to talk a little bit about some 19 O.
- later trappers on the Verde, and you talked about them 20
- in your direct a little bit. We'll start with the Day 21
- brothers in 1891 and 1892. 22
- 23 Α. Okay.
- 24 And, Debi, if you could pull up No. 3, which Ο.
- 25 is X001-18.

- 1 This is the easiest-to-read version of this
- 2 event. The newspaper is a little difficult.
- 3 Does it indicate they trapped the entire
- 4 Verde in a boat that they built?
- 5 A. Does it indicate they trapped the entire
- 6 Verde.
- 7 Q. Well, from Camp Verde down to the confluence
- 8 with the Salt.
- 9 A. That was my reading of it, yes.
- 10 Q. In a boat that they had built themselves?
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 Q. And then how did they get back upriver when
- 13 they were finished?
- 14 A. I believe they took a train. Am I not
- 15 mistaken?
- 16 O. Yeah, right down there at the bottom.
- 17 A. Yeah, yeah.
- 18 Q. And they didn't record any difficulty on any
- 19 of the rivers they talked about?
- 20 A. Yes. It's a rather brief description.
- 21 Q. Okay. And you weren't here when Mr. Fuller
- 22 testified about the Verde, so you didn't hear him say
- 23 that he thought the 800-mile figure seemed fairly high,
- 24 correct?
- 25 A. No, I was not here for that, no.

- The Day brothers didn't have a GPS? 1 Ο.
- 2 Α. They did not.
- Do you know if J.K. had family in Phoenix? 3 Ο.
- 4 Α. I do not.
- Does trapping take a little time? 5 Q.
- Trapping might take some time, yes, it does. 6 Α.
- Do you know that Mr. Day actually became one 7 Ο.
- 8 of our first wildlife officers in Arizona?
- I did not know that. 9 Α.
- Do you think any part of this account is made 10 Ο.
- 11 up?
- Α. 12 This is the first time this morning I read
- 13 it, and I would like to really review it and come to a
- 14 conclusion that would be accurate, for me.
- 15 Well, right. I understand that the distance Q.
- traveled is off. 16
- 17 Α. That's -- yes.
- Is it possible that they traveled up some 18 Ο.
- 19 tributaries and back down trapping, and so added that
- into their distance? 20
- 21 Well, it doesn't say that there, so I can't Α.
- 22 speak to that.
- 23 Is it possible, though? Ο.
- 24 Yes. Yeah, it is. Α.
- 25 Is it possible that without a GPS, they had a Ο.

- 1 little hard time accurately estimating how far they
- 2 traveled?
- 3 A. That's a fair assumption, yes.
- 4 Q. And is it possible that the boosterism of the
- 5 newspaper in Yuma thought 800 miles sounded like a
- 6 better figure than whatever the Day brothers reported?
- 7 A. If it's 800 miles to Yuma, I don't know if
- 8 that's very inviting. But I was just thinking about
- 9 it.
- 10 Q. I guess it depends on your perspective.
- 11 A. Yeah, because I think I may have to take a
- 12 long trip.
- 0. Careful, I was born there.
- 14 A. No, my brother lives there.
- 15 Q. Does any of this article strike you as the
- 16 kind of community boosterism that you would expect a
- 17 newspaper to exaggerate?
- 18 A. Yes, it does. You know, I think it's a
- 19 colorful. Is it feel-good? Maybe feel-good. I would
- 20 still have to really take a look at it line by line,
- 21 but I think boosterism is one aspect of it.
- 22 Q. Some of the other newspaper articles that we
- 23 looked at in other cases sort of emphasize the rapids
- 24 and the excitingness of the trip and things like that.
- 25 This doesn't do that?

- 1 No. It talks about the color, the beaver, Α.
- 2 patience, remuneration. I mean that's --
- 3 Five trips? Ο.
- 4 Five trips, it talks about that. I can't Α.
- 5 speak to that. I haven't seen any evidence of five
- trips, but that's what that says. 6
- And you think that might be boosterism? 7
- It certainly could be. It could be 8 Α.
- 9 boosterism, yes.
- 10 Okay. Let's then talk about a gentleman O.
- 11 named Fogal and his friend, who did a trapping trip in
- 1931. 12
- 13 Debi, could you bring up 4?
- 14 Α. Okay.
- And they traveled from Clarkdale to Fort 15 Q.
- McDowell using a flat-bottom boat. Have you seen this? 16
- 17 Α. I have not seen it. This is the first time.
- Actually, it sort of falls off the bottom of 18 Ο.
- 19 the screen a little bit there. I'll give you a moment
- to read it. 20
- 21 Α. Okay.
- 22 I guess my only question of what I read there
- 23 is it's 1931, and I haven't -- I didn't consider that.
- 24 I understand you haven't looked at it, but I
- mean these are a pair of guys who were doing the same 25

- 1 kind of activities that we're talking about --
- 2 A. Correct.
- 3 O. -- on the same river.
- 4 A. Okay. Agreed.
- 5 Q. A river that might be a little more difficult
- 6 to navigate, in fact, by 1931?
- 7 A. That's a good assumption.
- 8 Q. So in 1931, were newspapers prone to the same
- 9 kind of boosterism?
- 10 A. I think there is dialing back by 1931,
- 11 especially, during The Depression, I'm sure. This is a
- 12 feel-good story and an interesting story.
- 13 Q. So if the Day brothers could trap on the
- 14 Verde using a boat and Fogal and his friend could trap
- on the Verde using a boat and lots of people use a boat
- 16 on the Verde today, why couldn't other trappers do it?
- 17 A. Well, as I said earlier, I have not seen any
- 18 evidence during the period under discussion of that.
- 19 O. You haven't seen anybody say "I used a boat
- 20 on the Verde"?
- 21 A. I have not seen that, either in Spanish or in
- 22 English.
- Q. You also didn't hear anybody say "I couldn't
- 24 use a boat on the Verde"?
- 25 A. I have not heard that either.

- 1 O. The Verde's been known by a bunch of
- 2 different names?
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 CHAIRMAN NOBLE: Green.
- 5 BY MS. HERNBRODE:
- 6 Q. What names?
- 7 A. Oh, boy. I would have to go back, but it's
- 8 here in this report.
- 9 Q. You named a couple. The San Francisco,
- 10 the --
- 11 A. San Francisco. The --
- 12 Q. Rio Azul?
- 13 A. Rio Azul, Blau Fluss. A couple, yes.
- 14 Q. So if you were looking for historic
- 15 information about the Verde, you should probably look
- 16 for all of those names?
- 17 A. One would do that, yes.
- 18 Q. Does the Verde flow through relatively rugged
- 19 terrain?
- 20 A. In Segments 4 and 5, I would say moderate
- 21 compared to some of the other, you know, segments of
- 22 the river.
- 23 Q. Above that, much more rugged?
- 24 A. Yes, I would say that.
- Q. And is the area around the Verde, even today,

- 1 relatively unpopulated?
- 2 A. Comparatively to other areas in Arizona.
- 3 Q. There weren't a lot of settlers and explorers
- 4 in the area?
- 5 A. Not too many.
- 6 Q. Are you aware of U.S. Supreme Court cases
- 7 that say that just because a river is unexplored or
- 8 unused, that it's not necessarily nonnavigable?
- 9 A. I have heard that referenced in this
- 10 proceeding.
- 11 Q. Do you know what the Euro-American population
- 12 along the Verde was between the 1840s and 1880s?
- 13 A. The Euro-American, 1840, 1880s. I would
- 14 suspect -- let me think about it.
- No more than 1,000, I think, individuals.
- 16 O. And did the Apache aggressively resist
- 17 incursions into the Verde watershed up to the 1800s, up
- 18 through the 1800s?
- 19 A. Yeah, up to the middle part of the
- 20 19th Century, and before that, much more -- well, quite
- 21 vigorously, depending on what you read.
- 22 O. Are you familiar with what's been called the
- 23 Oatman Massacre on the Gila River?
- 24 A. Yes. Olive Oatman, yes, I'm familiar with
- 25 it. Haven't scrutinized it lately.

- 1 Q. Do you know what year that was?
- 2 A. 1857? I mean I picked that out. When was
- 3 it?
- 4 O. I think 1851.
- 5 A. '51. Close, yeah.
- 6 Q. That sound okay?
- 7 A. Yeah, that sounds about right, yeah.
- 8 Q. Can you tell us a little bit about what
- 9 happened there?
- 10 A. From my recollection, the group the Mojaves,
- 11 I believe it was the Mojave Tribe, murdered the family,
- 12 and they kept Olive, and there's a famous picture of
- 13 her with tattoos from her mouth to her jaw. But I did
- 14 not do any research into that for this proceeding.
- 15 Q. Killed off the family?
- 16 A. Yeah.
- 17 Q. Took the two sisters --
- 18 A. Yeah.
- 19 O. -- captive?
- 20 A. Correct.
- Q. And they were traded around a little bit?
- 22 A. They were traded around a little bit, yes.
- Q. And I believe, was the Mojave a Pai Tribe?
- 24 A. Pai Tribe, yes.
- Q. Okay. So related to the Yavapai?

- 1 A. Yavapai, yeah.
- 2 Q. So it wasn't just the Apache people and it
- 3 wasn't just in the 1860s that the native people in
- 4 Arizona were resisting settlement of their territories?
- 5 A. No. No, there was active resistance, yes.
- 6 Q. Do you know when the railroads appeared in
- 7 the Verde Valley?
- 8 A. Are you talking about the Prescott Stage from
- 9 Prescott to Ash Fork?
- 10 Q. I believe that was the first one.
- 11 A. Yeah, that was the first one. It's in the
- 12 1880s.
- 13 Q. Were mapmakers, either the military or the
- 14 Spanish mapmakers or the military mapmakers, trained in
- 15 assessing navigability?
- 16 A. No.
- 17 Q. They didn't apply The Daniel Ball test?
- 18 A. They did not know about it, no.
- 19 O. Okay. And you didn't look at the work of
- 20 federal surveyors for your report?
- 21 A. Not this time, for this, yeah.
- 22 O. Okay.
- 23 A. But I think, was that covered by
- 24 Dr. Littlefield?
- 25 Q. Dr. Littlefield.

- 1 A. Yes. Yes, so I didn't want to be redundant.
- Q. Why were the Fort McDowell and Fort Verde
- 3 posts established?
- 4 A. For protection, military protection, of the
- 5 increasing civilian population in this territory.
- 6 Q. The native peoples were fairly successfully
- 7 resisting our incursion into the territory?
- 8 A. That's correct, up until 1865, certainly, and
- 9 thus the establishment of several -- that had been
- 10 discussed throughout the territory, particularly
- 11 Central Arizona.
- 12 Q. Now, Ms. Summerhayes came to Arizona in 1874;
- 13 is that correct?
- 14 A. That's correct.
- 15 Q. Okay. So she was -- her husband was
- 16 stationed at Fort McDowell in 1877, does that sound
- 17 about right?
- 18 A. Right around there. She spent some time at
- 19 Fort Apache and then they came down.
- 20 Q. Were they ever stationed at Fort Verde, or
- 21 did they just pass through?
- 22 A. They were stationed there for a time, about a
- 23 year, from my recollection in reading the book.
- Q. And how long were they stationed at Fort
- 25 McDowell?

- 1 A. Oh, Fort McDowell? I think about one year,
- 2 if I'm not mistaken. I would have to go back and take
- 3 a look at the account.
- 4 Q. They moved around a lot?
- 5 A. They moved around, yeah. They moved to Fort
- 6 Yuma and around.
- 7 O. Okay. So I thought you said you weren't
- 8 going to testify about stuff after 1866, and I know I
- 9 went to law school to avoid math, but 1877 is well
- 10 after that.
- 11 A. Oh, I understand. Sure. It was
- 12 transportation, rugged transportation, so that jumped
- 13 out, yes.
- 14 Q. So she wasn't there for the 1883 trip by
- 15 Willcox and Andrews in a canvas skiff from Fort
- 16 McDowell to Barnum's Pier on the Salt River Canal?
- 17 A. She was not there.
- 18 Q. She was not there when Major Spaulding and
- 19 Captain Hatfield departed for Phoenix in 1888?
- 20 A. No, she was not. Didn't know about it.
- 21 Q. Didn't get to wave at the Day brothers going
- 22 by in 1891?
- 23 A. No, she didn't.
- O. Didn't see the lumber intended to float on
- 25 the Verde in 1894?

- 1 A. She did not.
- Q. And she certainly missed the 1931 trip of
- 3 Fogal and his friend?
- 4 A. Doubtlessly.
- 5 Q. Okay. When were the roads built by the
- 6 military? You talked about military roads this
- 7 morning, or this afternoon, I quess.
- 8 A. 1865 to 1870. Stoneman Road, 1870, and then
- 9 the Stoneman Grade also began in 1870.
- 10 Q. And that road went? Refresh me.
- 11 A. The first one, the Stoneman Road, went from
- 12 Fort Whipple to Fort McDowell; and Stoneman Grade went
- 13 from, roughly, Fort McDowell to what's now called, I
- 14 think, Picketpost at the base of Picketpost Mountain in
- 15 Superior; and then from there, from Picketpost, it went
- 16 up that grade. It was called Stoneman Grade. It was
- 17 very difficult. You still see remnants of it.
- 18 Q. Did Ms. Summerhayes travel by boat on the
- 19 Colorado?
- 20 A. I think she did, yes.
- 21 Q. Did she describe that as a pleasant
- 22 experience?
- 23 A. She described it as not a very pleasant
- 24 experience.
- 25 Q. Pretty horrifying?

- Pretty horrifying in the summer, yes. 1 Α.
- 2 And she noted a lot of details about how she Ο.
- got to Fort McDowell. Did she record details of how 3
- 4 other military people traveled in the area?
- That was an autobiographical account. 5 Α.
- Did she say anywhere affirmatively that the 6 Q.
- 7 Verde was not used for navigation?
- 8 She did not say affirmatively that the Verde Α.
- 9 wasn't used for navigation.
- 10 So when you say on Page 14 of your report O.
- 11 that military commanders never used the Verde, you mean
- 12 they didn't use the Verde while transporting
- 13 Ms. Summerhayes at least?
- 14 Not specifically that. I think that's -- the Α.
- 15 records that I've seen, they have not navigated -- they
- were not navigating the Verde, from what I've seen. 16
- 17 And Ms. Summerhayes, again, that was just an example of
- the difficulty of traveling through Arizona, whether it 18
- 19 was 1860 or whatever her account was, 1874.
- She's the only one that you talk about in 20 Q.
- your military section, her and Smith? 21
- 22 Α. Smith, yes.
- 23 Old Y.T. Ο.
- 24 Old Y.T. Α.
- Did she mention, in her passages about Fort 25 Ο.

- 1 Verde, the boat that was located there?
- 2 A. Did she mention? Did I mention or did she
- 3 mention?
- 4 Q. Did she mention?
- 5 A. She did not mention it.
- 6 Q. Does Ms. Summerhayes talk about swimming in
- 7 the Verde?
- 8 A. In that account, I don't believe she talks
- 9 about swimming. I'm not really sure, though.
- 10 Q. In her book, at all?
- 11 A. In her book. In her book, yeah.
- 12 Q. Let's pull up 6, which is X017-99, which is
- 13 Page 207 of Vanished Arizona.
- 14 A. So does she talk about swimming there? If
- 15 she does, I had forgotten.
- 16 Q. Last paragraph, about halfway down.
- 17 She talks about teaching somebody else to
- 18 swim there.
- 19 A. Okay, yeah. I had forgotten that anecdote.
- 20 Q. So, clearly, there were places on the Verde
- 21 that were deep enough that you had to swim in the area
- 22 of Fort McDowell?
- 23 A. One could infer that.
- Q. And then you talk about John Y.T. Smith, and
- 25 Mr. Smith established a hay camp along the Salt to

- 1 supply hay to Fort McDowell?
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 Q. And Fort McDowell is upstream from the Salt
- 4 River, where he established his hay camp?
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 Q. Hay is a pretty bulky kind of thing to
- 7 transport?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 Q. It doesn't do well if it gets wet?
- 10 A. It does not.
- 11 Q. In your opinion, is the Colorado River
- 12 navigable?
- 13 A. I believe it's been found navigable by the
- 14 courts, and so --
- 15 Q. And you wouldn't disagree with the courts?
- 16 A. I'm not going to disagree with the courts,
- 17 no.
- 18 Q. How about the Mississippi?
- 19 A. I think I would agree.
- 20 Q. Do roads run along either one of these
- 21 rivers?
- 22 A. Yes.
- Q. On Page 13 of your report, you state that
- 24 "Fort McDowell could not raise sufficient crops to
- 25 sustain the men, their families, and their livestock so

- 1 innovative entrepreneurs began to branch out."
- 2 And there's no citation for that; but then
- 3 when you testified, you talked about the fact that the
- 4 military was sort of pressured into seeking civilian
- 5 contractors rather than raising the food for
- 6 themselves.
- 7 A. Yeah.
- 8 Q. Is that what you were talking about in that
- 9 sentence?
- 10 A. Yeah, that there was protests from the local
- 11 population that the military should be fighting the
- 12 Indians, and so there was an adjustment about
- 13 the canal. Well, the canal was dug by order of General
- 14 McDowell and then -- basically, to try to sustain the
- 15 military operation there, and then there were protests,
- 16 and it was parcelled out to private sector individuals.
- 17 Q. So it wasn't really they couldn't raise
- 18 sufficient crops; it's just it was politically
- 19 expedient not to raise sufficient crops?
- 20 A. Yeah, they had other issues that they wanted
- 21 to address, and so that was the path of least
- 22 resistance for that outpost.
- Q. Do you know who Dr. Edgar Mearns is?
- 24 A. I think he was associated with the Fort
- 25 McDowell.

- 1 O. He was actually stationed at Fort Verde.
- 2 A. Fort Verde? Okay.
- 3 O. Between 1884 and 1888?
- 4 A. I remember reading something about him, yes.
- 5 Q. Was he the post surgeon and a naturalist?
- 6 A. I think, yes.
- 7 O. Is that a common overlap at that time?
- 8 A. Yes. Yeah, there were individuals posted
- 9 that were like that. I can think of one in Southern
- 10 Arizona at Fort Lowell, but I can't think of his name
- 11 right now. And, again, I didn't look at that post as
- 12 opposed to Fort McDowell.
- 13 Q. And, in fact, many of the great naturalists
- 14 of the 1800s were doctors?
- 15 A. Correct.
- 16 Q. Vandeveer Hayden, for instance, who ran --
- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 Q. -- one of the Great Surveys?
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 Q. Was there a similar doctor or naturalist at
- 21 Fort McDowell?
- 22 A. I'm not aware. I don't know.
- Q. Did you look at the records for the Fort?
- 24 A. I did not look at the records for the Fort
- 25 specifically for this proceeding.

- 1 O. I would like to talk a little bit about the
- 2 infamous two guys in a boat photo --
- 3 A. Okay.
- 4 Q. -- that I think you still have up there.
- 5 A. Yeah, sure.
- 6 Q. X035-167, Page 110.
- 7 Do you have any reason to disagree with other
- 8 experts' opinions of the location of this photo?
- 9 A. I don't have any reason to disagree with the
- 10 location.
- 11 Q. Do you have any doubts about the date on this
- 12 photo, at least the approximate date of this photo.
- 13 A. I think the approximate date. It looks like
- 14 the late 19th Century.
- 15 Q. I see from your CV, you have some exposure to
- 16 the Colorado River through Grand Canyon?
- 17 A. Some.
- 18 Q. Are you familiar with the boating history of
- 19 Grand Canyon?
- 20 A. I am not familiar with that dimension of its
- 21 history.
- Q. You know who John Wesley Powell was?
- 23 A. I do.
- Q. Do you know what kind of boats he used in
- 25 Grand Canyon?

- 1 A. I saw images of them in this proceeding, yes.
- 2 Q. But you don't know their cargo capacity or
- 3 draft?
- 4 A. I don't know those things.
- 5 Q. You would say those would be a boat that
- 6 would be available for commercial purposes at the time
- 7 of Arizona's statehood, as well --
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 Q. -- as the ones we talked about earlier --
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 Q. -- the canoes and flatboats and things like
- 12 that?
- 13 A. Yes. I would think so, yes.
- 14 Q. I'm trying to keep from us overlapping,
- 15 because I'm getting dirty looks over here.
- 16 A. Okay. I'm sorry.
- 17 Q. Would you characterize Mr. Powell's use of
- 18 the river as a commercial use?
- 19 A. No, I would characterize it as a scientific
- 20 survey.
- 21 Q. He was being paid a salary to boat down the
- 22 river, was he not?
- 23 A. Is that commerce along the river? That's for
- 24 you -- I think for the attorneys to decide. I mean I
- 25 really can't --

- 1 O. You don't have an opinion?
- 2 A. I don't have an opinion on that, no.
- 3 Q. Okay.
- 4 Do you know who the Kolb brothers were?
- 5 A. Yes, photographers in the canyon, yes.
- Q. Are you familiar with the boats they used in
- 7 Grand Canyon?
- 8 A. I'm not familiar with the boats they used.
- 9 Q. Okay. Do you have a standard for
- 10 navigability?
- 11 A. I do not.
- 12 Q. I would like to talk a little bit about the
- 13 historical records of boating we have for the Verde,
- 14 and I know you didn't include them because they
- 15 occurred after the dates you were focused on.
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 Q. And I think we've already talked about the
- 18 Day brothers in Segments 2 through 5 and Fogal and his
- 19 friend in those same segments.
- 20 Let's look at the record we have for Willcox
- 21 and Andrews in Segment 5, which is No. 8, and it is
- 22 X017-122.
- 23 A. Okay, I've read it.
- Q. Okay. These guys didn't seem to have --
- 25 didn't report any difficulties in their journey?

- 1 A. It appears not.
- Q. Okay. And then I'm not going to bring back
- 3 up the infamous photo of the guys in the boat, but they
- 4 apparently used a boat on the Verde?
- 5 A. Apparently. They're there.
- 6 Q. And then we have Major Spaulding and Captain
- 7 Hatfield in a canoe in 1888, also in Segment 5.
- This is X017-123, and it's 10, please, Debi.
- 9 I'll give you a minute to read this.
- 10 A. I'm going to have to get up.
- 11 Q. And there's a copy, actually, in the
- 12 notebooks there next to you.
- 13 A. Oh, good. Yeah.
- 14 Q. I'll find the page --
- 15 A. What page, yeah?
- 16 O. -- or the tab --
- 17 A. Tab.
- 18 Q. -- for you will be 6.
- 19 A. 6? Okay. One, two, three?
- 20 Q. Yes.
- 21 A. Okay. "Major Spaulding's Death"?
- 22 O. Yes.
- 23 A. Oh, the death.
- I have heard about this account before, but
- 25 this is the first time I've read it here.

- 1 O. And he was the Commandant at Fort McDowell?
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 O. What does that mean?
- 4 A. He was the --
- 5 Q. Guy in charge?
- 6 A. Top officer, yes.
- 7 Q. Okay. And he was apparently using a boat.
- 8 Do we know whether this was a pleasure or a business
- 9 trip?
- 10 A. Let me take another quick look.
- 11 It looked as though they were shooting as
- 12 they came, so it looks as though they were -- it was a
- 13 pleasure trip.
- 14 Q. Have you never done anything fun on a
- 15 business trip?
- 16 A. Yes, I've done something fun on a business
- 17 trip.
- 18 Q. So it's possible they could have been
- 19 traveling for military purposes and incidentally
- 20 shooting along the way, or it's possible they could
- 21 have been on a frolic?
- 22 A. Either/or.
- Q. Okay. And he died because his gun misfired
- 24 going over an irrigation diversion?
- 25 A. That's correct.

VERDE RIVER VOLUME 11 02/25/2015

- 1 Not because he drowned on the Verde or 0.
- 2 because the --
- 3 Α. No.
- 4 -- rapids were too big or anything like that? Ο.
- 5 It was a tragic event, yes. Α.
- Okay. Do you know who Dr. Ralph Palmer was? 6 Q.
- 7 No, I don't. Α.
- 8 He was the author of a book called Doctor on Ο.
- Horseback. Have you read that? 9
- 10 No, I haven't. Α.
- 11 We have an account from Dr. Palmer, and Ο.
- 12 that's is X017-97, page 29.
- 13 It's No. 12, Debi.
- 14 Α. Okay.
- 15 So starting with the first full paragraph Q.
- 16 there.
- 17 Α. "Sunday morning"? Okay. Oops, I'm sorry.
- 18 Okay. Thank you.
- Let me see if I can make it a little bigger. 19 Ο.
- Yeah, geez. 20 Α.
- 21 Does that help? Q.
- 22 Α. Yeah, that helps a lot. Thank you.
- 23 Okay.
- 24 He doesn't talk about, at least in this Ο.
- paragraph of this, like the boat was -- having a boat 25

COASH & COASH, INC. 602-258-1440 www.coashandcoash.com Phoenix, AZ

- 1 was an unusual event, does he?
- 2 A. No, there's no reference to it being unique.
- Q. Although, it does seem a little unique that
- 4 you have a horse that takes the boat trailer back?
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 Q. All right. I would also like to look at
- 7 X017-121, which is 13, Debi.
- 8 Can you just blow up the text there so it's
- 9 on the screen?
- 10 A. Okay, I've read it.
- 11 Q. So this is outside of your area. This is --
- 12 A. Yeah.
- 13 Q. -- up on the top part of the Verde.
- 14 A. It's fun learning.
- 15 Q. And it's 1917.
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 Q. But it actually shows a picture of the boat
- 18 that was used on the Verde.
- 19 A. Okay.
- Q. There it is.
- Do you have any reason to doubt this account?
- 22 A. I don't doubt that account, no.
- Q. Okay. And then looks look at X017-126.
- 24 So 14, Debi.
- You may have remembered this account from my

- 1 discussion of it with Dr. Littlefield.
- 2 A. Yes, I think I do.
- 3 Q. So these guys also used the Verde for
- 4 boating?
- 5 A. Apparently, yes.
- 6 Q. Okay. Don't these accounts contradict your
- 7 conclusion that the Verde wasn't boatable?
- 8 A. I don't necessarily think so. I think these
- 9 accounts, they're comparatively small in number, and I
- 10 think it's up to the Commission and the attorneys to
- 11 place these accounts in context and discuss what
- 12 susceptible means and natural, and I forgot the other
- 13 one. I feel like Governor Perry.
- 14 Q. It's been a long day.
- 15 A. I forgot the third one.
- 16 Q. Governor Perry is not the third part of your
- 17 test.
- 18 A. I know.
- 19 The other term that's -- the legal term
- 20 that's your charge and the Commission's charge to deal
- 21 with, yes.
- Q. Okay. Is it your opinion that since the
- 23 Verde was used for irrigation, it could not have been
- 24 used for irrigation or --
- Let me try that again.

- Α. 1 I know, I'm with you. Sorry.
- 2 Q. It's been a long day or a long week.
- 3 Is it your opinion that since the Verde was
- 4 used for irrigation, it could not have been used for
- 5 navigation?
- 6 Α. No.
- 7 Those are not mutually exclusive? Ο.
- 8 Α. They are not mutually exclusive.
- 9 Q. Okay.
- 10 MS. HERNBRODE: Luckily for you, that
- 11 concludes my cross-examination. Thank you so much.
- 12 THE WITNESS: Thank you.
- 13 MS. HERNBRODE: I believe you have
- 14 another tormenter.
- 15 THE WITNESS: Okay, tormenter.
- MR. HELM: That is cruel. 16
- 17 CHAIRMAN NOBLE: Mr. Helm, are you ready
- 18 to proceed?
- 19 MR. HELM: I am.
- 20 CHAIRMAN NOBLE: Jody? Jack?
- 21 Go ahead, John.
- 22
- 23 CROSS-EXAMINATION
- 24 BY MR. HELM:
- 25 Hello, Dr. August. I think we've done this 0.